Performing the Janaazah salaah in a Masjid

Question: The Ghayr Muqallid Molvi Abdul Jaleel Saamrodi has published a newsletter in Gujarati with a heading in red stating, "Performing the Janaazah salaah inside the Masjid according to the Hanafi Madh'hab". He quotes from Mulla Ali Qaari رحمه الله of the 10th century that according to a narration of Muslim, Hadhrat Aa'isha رضي الله عنها swore on oath that Rasulullaah ρ performed the Janaazah salaah for the two sons of Baydaa inside the Masjid.

He writes further that:

- the Sahabah ψ performed the Janaazah salaah of Hadhrat Abu Bakr τ and Hadhrat Umar τ inside the Masjid
- at the worst, the act may be regarded only as Makrooh Tanzeehi
- the practice of performing the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is still in vogue in Makkah today

There is a Hadith quoted in *Hidaayah* stating, "There is no reward (or "nothing" according to another narration) for the person who performs the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid." Molvi Saamrodi says that the words "there is no reward" is not to be found in any book of Ahadeeth. Quoting from Qutbuddeen Hanafi رحمه الله, he asserts that it is permissible and not at all Makrooh to perform the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid.

Many people are now in doubt after this publication. Could you please clarify the situation with references.

Answer: The preferred opinion, the *Zaahir Riwaayah* and the opinion according to which Fataawaa are issued (*Muftaa Bihi*) state that it is Makrooh and forbidden to place the body inside the Masjid and to perform the Janaazah salaah there without a valid reason.

1. Rasulullaah ρ stated, "There shall be nothing for the one who performs the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid".[1] This Hadith is reliable and whatever has been said against it is wrong[2]. This narration of Abu Dawood contains the word "nothing", whereas other scripts contain the words "there is no reward". The research of Muhaddith Khateeb رحمه الله as well as that of Ibn Abdul Birr رحمه الله concur that the word is "nothing".[3]

2. Narrations from Hadhrat Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله of the 2nd century (passed away 189 A.H.), Hadhrat Imaam Abu Yusuf رحمه الله and Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله all unanimously state that it is Makrooh to perform the Janaazah salaah inside the Masjid.[4]

---

[1] Abu Dawood (Vol.2 Pg.98) and Ibn Maajah (Vol.1 Pg.238).
[2] *Zaadul Ma'aad* (Vol.1 Pg.144).
[3] Ayni's commentary of *Hidaayah* (Vol.1 Pg.1109) and *Umdatul Qaari* (Vol.8 Pg.118).
[4] *Jaami'us Sagheer* (Pg.183).

3. Hadhrat Imaam Tahaawi رحمه الله of the 3rd Islaamic century (passed away 321 A.H.) states that it has been reported from Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله, Imaam Abu Yusuf رحمه الله and Imaam Abu Haneefah رحمه الله that performing the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is Makrooh.[5]

4. Imaam Abul Hasan Qudoori رحمه الله of the 4th and 5th Islaamic century (passed away 428 A.H.) clearly states, "The Janaazah salaah in Jamaa'ah cannot be performed in the Masjid."[6]

5. Faqih Imaam Sarakhsi رحمه الله of the 5th Islaamic century (passed away 490 A.H.) also states that according to the Hanafi Madh'hab, it is Makrooh to perform the Janaazah salaah inside the Masjid.[7]

6. Imaam Taahir Bukhaari رحمه الله of the 6th Islaamic century (passed away 542 A.H.) says, "It is Makrooh to perform the Janaazah salaah in a Masjid where salaah in Jamaa'ah takes place."[8]

7. Faqih Abul Barakaat Nasafi رحمه الله of the 7th and 8th Islaamic century (passed away 710 A.H.) also says that the Janaazah salaah may not be performed in the Masjid.[9]

8. The Faqih Sadrush Shari'ah رحمه الله of the 8th Islaamic century (passed away 747 A.H.) also says that it is Makrooh.[10]

9. Haafidhud Deen Shihaab Kurdi رحمه الله of the 9th Islaamic century (passed away 827 A.H.) says the same.[11]

1. Faqih Allaama Ibn Nujaym Misri رحمه الله of the 10th Islaamic century (passed away 969 A.H.) stated that it is forbidden to bring the body of a deceased person into the Masjid.[12]

10. Allaama Muhaddith Mulla Ali Qaari رحمه الله of the 11th Islaamic century (passed away 1014 A.H.), whom is quoted in the question, said, "It is Makrooh according to us and according to Imaam Maalik رحمه الله to perform the Janaazah salaah in a Masjid that has not been built for the purpose (of performing Janaazah salaah).[13]

As for the narration of Hadhrat Aa'isha رضي الله عنها, the Janaazah salaah was performed in the Masjid at the time because of certain constraints. A general ruling cannot be proven from this. The Janaazah salaahs of Hadhrat Abu Bakr

---

[5] *Sharhu Ma'aanil Aathaar* (Vol.1 Pg.285).
[6] *Qudoori* (Pg.35).
[7] *Mabsoot* (Vol.2 Pg.68).
[8] *Khulaasatul Fataawaa* (Vol.1 Pg.222).
[9] *Kanzud Daqaa'iq* (Pg.25).
[10] *Mukhtasar Wiqaayah* (Pg.23).
[11] *Fataawaa Bazzaaziyyah* (Vol.1 Pg.32)
[12] *Ashbaa Wan Nadhaa'ir* (Pg.557).
[13] *Sharhun Niqaayah* (Vol.1 Pg.136).

τ and Hadhrat Umar τ could not be performed anywhere else but in the Masjid because the two of them were buried in Rasulullaah ρ's room (which falls inside the Masjid).

Furthermore, the Masjidul Haraam is exempted from the prohibition because it has been designated for the performance of the five salaahs, the Eid salaah, the Jumu'ah salaah, the salaahs for solar and lunar eclipses, Salaatul Istisqaa and many other purposes.[14]

The gist of it all is that Ulema have regarded the Janaazah salaah to be Makrooh in the Masjid for the past 1300 years, as has been made clear above. For further reference, please refer to the following books:

- *Fataawaa Qaadhi Khan* (Vol.1 Pg.32)
- *Fataawaa Siraajiyyah (Pg.23)*
- *Fataawaa Aalamgeeri* (Vol.1 Pg.165)
- *Fataawaa Barhana* (Vol.1 Pg.165)
- *Sharhul Wiqaayah* (Vol.1 Pg.161)
- *Hidaayah* (Vol.1 Pg.255)
- *Durrul Mukhtaar with Shaami (Vol.1 Pg.828)*
- *Tahtaawi (Vol.1 Pg.605)*
- *Bahrur Raa'iq (Vol.2 Pg.187)*
- *Minhatul Khaaliq (Vol.2 Pg.187)*
- *Majma'ul Anhur (Vol.1 Pg.184)*
- *Rasaa'ilul Arkaan (Pg.185)*
- *Naf'ul Mufti was Saa'il (Pg.143)*
- *Kabeeri (Pg.545)*
- *Sagheeri (Pg.291)*
- *Nurul Idhaa (Pg.138)*
- *Maraaqil Falaah (Pg.117)*
- *Zujaajatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.462)*
- *Sharhu Safris Sa'aadah (Pg.256)*
- *Fat'hul Mulhim (Vol.2 Pg.495)*
- *Ayni's commentary of Kanzud Daqaa'iq (Pg.67)*
- *Tab'yeenul Haqaa'iq (Vol.1 Pg.243)*
- *Mustakhlisul Haqaa'iq (Pg.274)*
- *Maa Laa Budda Minhu (Pg.83)*

The two reasons for the act being Makrooh are:

1. The Masjid has been designated for the performance of salaah and those acts that are associated with salaah, not for the Janaazah salaah. In fact, even Rasulullaah ρ has designated another place for the Janaazah salaah. Refer to Bukhaari (Vol.1 Pg.177) and Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.309)

---

[14] *Sharhun Niqaayah* (Vol.1 Pg.136).

Ibn Habeeb رحمه الله mentioned that the place for performing the Janaazah salaah in Madinah was a place adjacent to easterly side of the Masjid.[15]

In his *Mu'atta*[16], Imaam Muhammad رحمه الله states that the place where the Janaazah salaah is performed in Madinah is the same place outside the Masjidun Nabawi where Rasulullaah ρ used to lead the Janaazah salaah.

Mulla Ali Qaari رحمه الله states, "The place where the Janaazah salaah used to be performed (during the time of Rasulullaah ρ) is a well known place outside the Masjid."[17]

In a narration of *Mishkaatul Masaabeeh*, a Sahabi τ says, "We were sitting outside the Masjid on the plot adjacent to the Masjid where the Janaazah salaah used to be performed and Rasulullaah ρ was sitting with us…" Commenting on this Hadith, Mulla Ali Qaari رحمه الله says that this proves that the Sahabah ψ did not perform the Janaazah salaah inside the Masjidun Nabawi.[18]

Fataawaa Qaadhi Khan states, "It was always the practice of the pious predecessors to designate a separate area for the Janaazah salaah. If performing the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid was not Makrooh and prohibited, why would they have forsaken the Masjid for this purpose?"

Haafidh Ibn Qayyim Hambali رحمه الله whose opinions even the Ghayr Muqallideen accept has stated, "It was the practice of the Sahabah ψ to prepare the deceased for burial, place him on a bier and to perform the Janaazah salaah outside the Masjid."[19]

He then sums it up by adding, "It was always the practice of Rasulullaah ρ to perform the Janaazah salaah outside the Masjid and not inside."[20] He says further that it did sometimes occur that Rasulullaah ρ had to perform the Janaazah salaah inside the Masjid, such as the case of Suhayl bin Baydaa τ and his brother. However, this was not the usual practice of Rasulullaah ρ."

Thereafter, he concludes by saying, "The correct manner is that which we have stated at the beginning i.e. that it was the practice of Rasulullaah ρ to perform the Janaazah salaah outside the Masjid."[21]

---

[15] *Fat'hul Baari* (Vol.3 Pg.160).
[16] Pg.131.
[17] *Mirqaat* (Vol.2 Pg.357).
[18] Mirqaat (Vol.3 Pg.343).
[19] *Zaadul Ma'aad* (Vol.1 Pg.143).
[20] *Zaadul Ma'aad* (Vol.1 Pg.143).
[21] *Zaadul Ma'aad* (Vol.1 Pg.144).

Allaam Ibn Humaam رحمه الله asserts, "It is an established fact that it was the regular and perpetual practice of Rasulullaah ρ not to bring the bodies of deceased people into the Masjid."[22]

In fact, Rasulullaah ρ was so particular about the practice that although he heard about the death of Najaashi while sitting in the Masjid, he went outside to perform the Janaazah salaah at the place where they usually performed the Janaazah salaah.[23] This was despite the fact that there was no corpse present. This was so that the Masjid is not used for what it is not intended.

Fat'hul Baari (Vol.3 Pg.160) states that the Hadith of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ (concerning *Rajam*) makes it evident that a separate place was designated for the Janaazah salaah and that it was only because of some reason that the Janaazah salaah was performed inside the Masjid or to show that it is permissible.

Allaama Ibnul Haaj رحمه الله says that the Sahabah ψ and the pious predecessors never performed the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid.[24]

This is also substantiated by the Hadith of Hadhrat Aa'isha رضي الله عنها stated in the question. Note the following:

- The request that Hadhrat Aa'isha رضي الله عنها made indicates that it was not the norm to perform the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid. Why else would she have to request for it?

- The refusal of the Sahabah ψ indicates also that it was the practice of Rasulullaah ρ not to perform the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid. The only reason in this case for the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is the fact that the deceased had been sitting in I'tikaaf in the Masjid, as is evident from other narrations of Ahadeeth.[25]

- A clear proof indicating that performing the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid conflicts with the Sunnah is a Hadith of Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.313) stating, **"Funeral biers were never brought into the Masjid."**

- It is possible that Hadhrat Aa'isha رضي الله عنها was unaware of the specific reason for which the Janaazah salaah of the sons of Baydaa were performed in the Masjid. It is also possible that she arrived at this opinion after much deliberation, but her opinion was not shared by the other Sahabah ψ.

---

[22] *Fat'hul Qadeer* (Vol.2 Pg.96).
[23] Bukhaari (Vol.1 Pg.177) and Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.309).
[24] *Kitaabul Madkhal* (Vol.2 Pg.81).
[25] *Mazaahire Haqq* (Vol.2 Pg.49).

The gist of the above is that the Hadith of Hadhrat Aa'isha رضي الله عنها does not oppose, but rather supports the viewpoint of the Hanafi Madh'hab. **In fact, when there is a valid reason, Hanafi Ulema say that it is permissible to perform the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid without this being Makrooh at all.**

2. The second reason why performing the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is Makrooh is the possibility of the Masjid being soiled. Because it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Masjid to be kept clean at all times, it must be safeguarded from anything that will soil it because this would defile its sanctity.

   In a narration[26] from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar τ, Rasulullaah ρ warned against even passing through the Masjid with a piece of raw meat . in another narration, Rasulullaah ρ said, **"Keep your children and insane ones away from the Masjid."** Allaama Diyaa'ud Deen Sanaawi رحمه الله of the 8th Islaamic century states that the reason for keeping such people away from the Masjid is the fact that they are likely to soil the Masjid, which is exactly the same reason for prohibiting corpses from coming to the Masjid.[27]

   Mabsoot[28] states that if children are prohibited from coming to the Masjid for this reason, then moreso will the prohibition apply to dead bodies.

   Salaah Mas'oodi[29] states that since dead bodies are likely to have impurities on them, they are prevented from entering the Masjid, which must compulsorily be kept clean and pure.

   If the Sunnah of not performing the Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is not being presently carried out in the Masjidun Nabawi, this cannot be used a proof for its permissibility.

   Allaama Ayni رحمه الله stated, "The people of Madinah were safeguarded from acts of Bid'ah during the times of Rasulullaah ρ and the Khulafaa Raashideen. During these times, their acts could be regarded as proof for what is right. However, things changed a lot after the three generations and acts of Bid'ah became increasingly prevalent, especially during our times."[30]

   Speaking of the condition during his times, Mulla Ali Qaari رحمه الله (passed away 1014 A.H.) states, **"The present inhabitants of the holy two Harams are ensnared in acts of Bid'ah and sin."**[31] In fact, Mulla Ali

---

[26] Ibn Maajah (Pg.55).
[27] *Nisaabul Ihtisaab* (Pg.33).
[28] Vol.2 Pg.68.
[29] Vol.2 Pg.215.
[30] *Majmoo'ah Fataawaa*.
[31] *Mirqaat* (Vol.3 Pg.371).

Qaari رحمه الله has written a booklet on the acts of Bid'ah practised by the inhabitants of the holy two Harams.

If any Hanafi scholar issues a Fatwa that conflicts with the *Zaahir Riwaayah* and the opinion according to which Fataawaa are issued (*Muftaa Bihi*), then this is no indictment against the Madh’hab.

The two reasons have therefore been given for the fact that performing Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is Makrooh. Considering the first reason, Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is Makrooh Tanzeehi and considering the second reason, Janaazah salaah in the Masjid is Makrooh Tahreemi. And Allaah knows best what is most correct.